



ADVOCACY ON GOOD GOVERNANCE ON WATER RESOURCES AND SANITATION IN MOMBASA AND TAITA TAVETA COUNTIES



**Final Evaluation Report
February 2018**

**Prepared by
Judith Omondi
Judith.omondi2@gmail.com**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	3
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	3
ACRONYMS	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1. INTRODUCTION	8
1.1. Background	8
1.2. Objective of the Evaluation	9
1.3. Methodology	9
2. FINDINGS	10
2.1. Progress of Achievements Towards Project Objectives	10
2.1.1. <i>Empowering Rights Holders in the two counties to actively participate in and influence county planning processes including relevant WASH bills</i>	10
2.1.2. <i>Empowering Rights Holders in the two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county's delivery of WASH services</i>	12
2.1.3. <i>Improved understanding of Duty Bearers in their role and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services</i>	17
2.2. Relevance	18
2.3. Effectiveness	18
2.4. Efficiency	19
2.5. Impact	20
2.6. Sustainability	22
3. CHALLENGES	23
4. LESSONS LEARNED/ALTERNATIVES	24
5. RECOMMENDATIONS	25
6. ANNEXES	27

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This End of Project External Evaluation was contracted by Danish People' Aid (DPA) in partnership with Maji Na Ufanisi (MNU). It has been executed by independent development consultant Judith Omondi. The review was successfully completed, with thanks to Stephen Kariuki, Alice Karuga, Simon Kazungu and the rest of the MNU team who facilitated engagements with various stakeholders and for their strategic inputs at the various sites and stages of the review. The consultant is also grateful to Peder Thorning from DPA who provided invaluable administrative and technical support, as well as the many stakeholders who took time out of their busy schedules to meet with the consultant during the field visits.

The views expressed in this report do not in any way represent the views of MNU or DPA, and although care has been taken to minimize errors in the report, the review consultant takes full responsibility for any unintentional factual errors or omissions that may be in the report.

ACRONYMS

BOQ	Bills of Quantity
CBO	Community Based Organization
CHAST	Child Hygiene And Sanitation
CIDP	County Integrated Development Plan
CLTS	Community Led Total Sanitation
CSO	Curriculum Support Officer
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DPA	Danish Peoples Aid
GoK	Government of Kenya
KUPPET	Kenya Union of Post Primary Teachers
MCA	Member of County Assembly
MNU	Maji Na Ufanisi
MOWASCO	Mombasa Water and Sewerage Company
MP	Member of Parliament
MCWAG	Mombasa County Water Action Group
NEMA	National Environmental Management Authority
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
PHAST	Participatory Hygiene And Sanitation Transformation
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
TAVEVO	Taita Taveta Water Company
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WRMA	Water Resource Management Authority

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides the findings of the final evaluation of the project: Advocacy on Good Governance on Water Resources and Sanitation in Mombasa and Taita Taveta Counties. The project had a particular focus on citizen participation in local governance and included components of capacity building for participatory planning and citizen demands for social accountability. The project was funded by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark through Civil Society in Development (CISU) and implemented by Danish People's Aid in partnership with Maji Na Ufanisi, a Kenyan based NGO. The project was initially to be implemented over a three-year period (from December 2014 to December 2017) but was extended to 28 February 2018, with a 9-month implementation gap period in between.

Key Findings

Relevance: The project was highly relevant, as it was consistent both with the goals of Maji Na Ufanisi and DPA as well as the national WASH legislation and policy. The relatively poor coverage of WASH facilities and awareness in the target areas further emphasized the project relevance. The project focus on governance in the context of devolution in Kenya was highly relevant in the light of the transitional challenges faced with integrating citizen participation into county planning and policy making processes.

Effectiveness: The project demonstrated effectiveness by reaching and in some case surpassing its targets, leaving behind effective community and county level participatory structures. The knowledge acquired from capacity building of 2,255 rights holders and duty bearers has created a community of WASH practitioners who have and will act as advocates of participatory governance and social accountability in the two counties. In addition to capacity building, the project has initiated long term behavior change in personal hygiene and environmental sanitation beyond the target schools and surrounding communities. Flexibility was also a key element in the effectiveness of the project. However, the loss of trained county technical staff in reshuffles that followed the elections limited effectiveness.

Efficiency: Based on the immediate and anticipated long term transforming effect on county governance, service delivery and community WASH practice, the project was found to be highly efficient. By design, the project's long-term approach guarantees sustainability, which ensures value for money. The project also leveraged resources and existing networks to add value and enhance project benefits. Efficiency was, however, dented by the delayed completion of the hardware component on the school WASH activities, a challenge attributed to the implementation gap period.

Impact: The project has successfully translated the meaning of citizen participation and demonstrated practical methods of institutionalizing it within county government structures. It has significantly improved WASH services in both counties, due to increased responsiveness and social accountability among water service providers. For learners, the project brought significant improvement in school enrollment, attendance and performance in beneficiary schools. At the community level, all stakeholders felt that behavior change among beneficiary communities, like ending of open defecation, was attributable to the project. One of the unexpected outcomes of the project was the peaceful settling of water conflict between pastoralists and farming groups in Taveta.

Sustainability: The project’s foundational work in “unpacking” devolution, especially creating operational structures for citizen participation will act as a valuable template for implementing citizen engagement beyond the two beneficiary counties.

CHALLENGES

- **Political risks** - The project was implemented in between two general elections of 2013 and 2017 and was therefore subject to the associated political instability and change of office bearers. Although this political risk had been anticipated in the project planning stage, the disputed presidential election results prolonged the instability in target areas and negatively impacted on some project outcomes. By its design, the project must work with political actors and processes, and hence future programming will need strong mitigation measures against impact of elections
- **Staff changes** - Linked to political risk was the institutional setback, caused by county technical personnel reshuffles after elections. Such staff changes after every elections not only undermine the stability of county governments, but also their capacity to deliver service to the population as reflected by its disruptive effect on project’s capacity building efforts. Some changes also occurred before the elections, affecting commitments that had been made by predecessors.
- **Implementation-gap** -The nine-month gap in project implementation occasioned delays that have adversely affected the efficiency of the project, especially with respect to schedules of delivery for some of its components. The component most affected pertains to the rain water harvesting facilities planned for two beneficiary schools, which had by end of project, not been completed. A major factor was the midway adjustment (at the request of both county governments) introducing new beneficiary schools for the rainwater harvesting, separate from the two initial targets of WASH health promotion. Also affected by the gap period was the capacity building for duty bearers.
- **Corruption** - Corruption and Political interests were reported to be the main threat to the adoption of citizen participation in both Mombasa and Taita Taveta counties. Stakeholders contended that even though devolution was meant to bring services and social accountability there were still pockets of resistance that were undermining genuine engagement. The concerns were more directed at Mombasa county although in Taita Taveta, access to county assembly members was an issue.
- **Information sharing** - Citizen participation in county planning and policy making is a constitutional requirement, however, its quality and effectiveness was undermined by limited flow of information from the county governments.
- **Lack of WASH budget** – With no dedicated budget for WASH in the counties, there was limited county resources that can directly be allocated to WASH.
- **Local ownership of schools** - Motivating parents in poor communities to contribute towards operations and maintenance (O&M) of school infrastructure was an issue for most schools.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Support to water action groups – Mombasa County Water Action Group (MCWAG) and Okoa Maji should be financially and technically supported to properly formulate and grow their institutional arrangements.
- Inclusion of natural water resource conservation and related impacts of climate change as essential elements in rights-based WASH programming.
- Allocating adequate resources for media for highlighting and reporting on WASH issues.
- Lobbying for the retention and maintenance of county chief technical officers.
- Given the interdependent nature of schools and their surrounding communities, future school water projects should consider including considerations for community access.
- Citizen action groups should be established at sub-county and village levels further enhance citizen capacity for advocacy, monitoring, reporting and social accountability county development programmes.
- Maji Na Ufanisi should mobilize additional resources for continued capacity building especially strengthening citizens ability for advocacy, monitoring, reporting and social accountability, and ensure continued dissemination at the grassroots.
- County WASH governance programming should tailor and adapt its strategies to each context, rather than use one-approach for every county.

1. INTRODUCTION¹

1.1. Background

The project was implemented against the backdrop of a new constitution promulgated in 2010. The constitution recognizes access to water and sanitation as a basic and legal right of all Kenyans, in particular sections 43 (1) b and d, which state that *“Every person (Kenyan) has the right to accessible and adequate housing, and to reasonable standards of sanitation, clean and safe water in adequate quantities”*. Consequently, Kenyan citizens now have a right to demand efficient water and sanitation services from the designated service providers. Furthermore, The Water Act 2016 provides the regulatory framework for management and development of water resources, and water and sewerage services in line with the new Constitution as well as the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

Under the constitution, Kenya has 47 County Administrations, with an allocation of 15% of the national budget per annum. In marginalized counties, there is an additional equalization fund allocation. Civil society is considered a vital part of devolution process, especially in supporting advocacy for better service delivery these counties. The project was designed in acknowledgement that its implementation would take place at the onset of devolution, which despite its massive potential to enhance service delivery to Kenyans, still faces teething challenges including initial confusion over inter-governmental roles between national and county governments; high cost of devolving national functions and structures to the counties, and the resulting human resource gaps.

The overall aim of the project *“Strengthening Citizens’ Influence on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) in the Devolved Governance System in Mombasa and Taita Taveta Counties”* is to support improvement of the overall quality of life of the disadvantaged of Mombasa and Taita Taveta in by improved WASH services. The immediate objectives of the project are:

- **Objective 1:** Rights holders in the two counties empowered to actively participate in and influence county WASH planning processes by end of February 2018 including relevant WASH county bills.
- **Objective 2:** Rights holders in the two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county’s delivery of WASH services by end of February 2018.
- **Objective 3:** Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services

Its interventions are primarily focused in the areas of advocacy, capacity building of CBOs, policy formulation and networking.

Table 1: Project objectives and indicators of progress

Project development objective	Immediate objective	Indicators
To contribute to the Improved to an improved quality of life of the disadvantaged in	1.Rights holders in the 2 counties empowered to actively participate in and influence county WASH planning processes by end	i. By end of the project rights holders will have increased knowledge and awareness of basic rights including WASH rights. ii. By end of the project rights holders will be actively involved in county development

¹ Sourced from project document

Mombasa and Taita Taveta counties by improved WASH Services.	of 2017 including relevant WASH county bills.	planning and formulation of County WASH-related Bills.
	2. Rights holders in two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county's delivery of WASH services by the end of 2017.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. By end of the project rights holders have gathered evidence-based input, which can be used to advocate for accountability in counties' delivery of WASH services. ii. By the end of the project rights holders will have presented input into counties' planning of WASH services.
	3. Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. By end of the project duty bearers have an increased understanding of the devolved governance system, and their role in regards to delivering of WASH services. ii. By end of the project, there will be increased interaction between rights holders and duty bearers in WASH planning and implementation.

1.2. Objective of the Evaluation

The purpose of the external evaluation was to assess the degree to which the project has achieved its objectives. More specifically, the evaluation focused on assessing the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of the project. On relevance, the evaluation interrogated how the project responded to the needs of the target population, and whether its activities were consistent with the intended impact of the project. To determine effectiveness, the evaluation looked into the extent to which the project objectives were achieved and what contributed to these achievements, with particular emphasis on the development of local capacities in participatory governance in WASH, as an effective means of achieving sustainable development.

On impact, the evaluation looked into changes that have occurred as an outcome of project implementation. A special interest was to determine the extent to which project activities have empowered communities to actively self-mobilize in their local WASH initiatives as opposed to being passive participants. At the same time, close attention was paid to accountability mechanisms existing and functioning at the county level, with a special attention to cross cutting issues (notably gender and environment).

To determine efficiency, the evaluation examined the strategies used and how project resources and time were utilized to maximize project benefits. Assessing sustainability was more concerned with how local citizen capacities and resilience have been enhanced to continue generating local resources and goodwill for ensuring project benefits are sustained long after donor funding has ceased. In particular, the evaluation was keen to see how well the established school WASH activities and participatory governance platforms have been systematized for long-term benefit.

1.3. Methodology

The evaluation largely used qualitative methods to answer the evaluation questions and to gather the various perspectives of the beneficiary groups consulted. Secondary data collected from project documents, project baseline survey, and the school impact assessment, also provided quantitative basis for corroborating evaluation results. Primary data was collected through interviews, focused

discussions, and through the rapid knowledge tests. Due to the limited time available for fieldwork, conducting an elaborate sample survey of change in perception and behavior was not feasible. However, the rapid knowledge tests conducted during group consultations revealed the extent of changes in WASH awareness and attitude. Using a structured but orally administered questionnaire, the consultant administered a limited number of open-ended questions to allow the respondents to demonstrate their knowledge. The analysis of change was carried out with primary data, correlated with the quantitative data from secondary sources.

The following stakeholders participated in the evaluation:

- Community representatives of Mombasa and Taita Taveta counties, notably Okoa Maji Action Group from Taita Taveta and Mombasa County Water Action Group (MCWAG).
- Taita Taveta County Ministry of Water and Irrigation.
- National government agencies e.g. Ministry of Water, Environment, Natural Resources, the National Environmental Management Authority (NEMA) and Kenya Union Of Post Primary Teachers (KUPPET), the Ministry of Health.

In total, 18 citizen action group members, 12 educators, 12 duty bearers, 38 parents and 60 school pupils were consulted. The evaluation however did not succeed in meeting with duty bearers in Mombasa.

2. FINDINGS

2.1. Progress and Achievements Towards Project Objectives

2.1.1. *Empowering Rights Holders in the two counties to actively participate in and influence county planning processes including relevant WASH bills*

The interventions supported under this objective involved capacitating citizens through their representatives, to participate and influence County planning and policymaking processes. Counties are a key pillar of devolved governance under the Constitution promulgated in 2010. Devolution seeks to bring services closer to the people, with county governments at the center of dispersing political power and economic resources to Kenyans at the grassroots. Capacity building under this component involved the establishment and training of Water Action Committees/Groups drawn from local community networks with the aim enhancing their knowledge and skills on water, sanitation hygiene with the concept of devolution that would assist them in their engagement with county authorities. The trainings conducted specifically focused on the following themes:

- WASH concepts
- Devolution and its functions
- Analysis of article 10 of the constitution regarding water rights.
- Strategy of Citizen participation
- Role of County government in ensuring effective service delivery
- The role of the community in ensuring water serve every individual in Taita Taveta

Baseline surveys conducted by the project in both target counties had reflected a generally poor local understanding of the principles of public participation in the context of devolution on the minds of many residents and county authorities, who were being “slow” in making progress in adopting inclusive governance. This had contributed to public perceptions of corruption, discrimination and tribalism, as well a general low trust in the county officials. Admittedly, citizen representatives in both counties had

themselves initially not been aware of the importance of good WASH practices such as boiling water, or issues such as legal permits pertaining to drilling boreholes. As at the end of the project period, however, significant changes in the levels of knowledge on the concept of citizen participation as well as WASH policy and practice were evident.

A key area of achievement is the success in establishing vibrant water action groups to act as links between citizens and duty bearers. Since their establishment, the two water action committees, Okoa Maji (Taita Taveta) and Mombasa County Water Action Group (MCWAG) have acquired the critical skills needed in WASH advocacy and lobbying as well as engaging in participatory planning, budgeting and other county decision-making processes. Interactions with members of both committees revealed extensive technical familiarity with the day-to-day county government procedures and processes, including planning, budgeting and policy development. They also demonstrated reasonable level of comfort with policy level WASH advocacy, such as use of media, formal language for official meetings, and positive engagement techniques used in lobbying. Through their skills, the two action groups were reported to have self-mobilized and steered advocacy work during project implementation gap period without technical backing from the project team.

With respect to the quality of citizen participation in county planning and policymaking, results are significant especially in Taita Taveta County which has embraced openness and consistent engagements with Okoa Maji. The County Integrated Development Plan (CIDP) was therefore developed with citizen inputs as its basis. The incorporated citizen priorities were a product of citizen led mapping of local WASH services, needs and priorities.

The county planning process in Mombasa, was however less inclusive and did not fully incorporate citizen input due to initial resistance of the part of county authorities. By comparison, MCWAG has dedicated more time and effort advocating attitude change among Mombasa County officials, with a gradual improvement being reported.

Through MCWAG and Okoa Maji, the two Counties have also been provided with a better structured mechanism for implementing citizen participation beyond WASH. To establish the basis for their work with the counties, the two bodies developed memoranda outlining the status of WASH and key policy actions that should be prioritized.

On social accountability, Okoa Maji and MCWAG have been acknowledged as legitimate citizen watchdogs by engaging in regular meetings with water service providers (Mombasa Water and Sewerage Company (MOWASCO) and TAVEVO in Taita Taveta) to address WASH challenges facing residents such as dry taps, poor connections, and vandalism of water facilities. A key result in this area was the reported improvements in access to clean water at household level. Challenges like inflated water bills, vandalism of water facilities, are being resolved through shared platforms established between citizen representatives and county service providers. In the case of Taita Taveta, a complaint register linked to its billing mechanism has been established, which is gradually helping to improve its services and public perception.

The water action committees also have championed citizen ownership and leadership role in the mobilization for the World Water Day and other public events and using such opportunities to carry out public sensitization on WASH as well as the conservation of the increasingly endangered natural

water sources. For example, Okoa Maji successfully lobbied the county governor to prioritize a sewer system for Voi town and relocate the town's dumpsite from the Voi river bank. The body also was a key influencer in the drafting of Taita Taveta's water policy currently under consideration by the county assembly.

2.1.2. Empowering Rights Holders in the two counties to demand accountability in the county's delivery of WASH services.

The focus of this component was capacitating target schools as community centers for WASH training. The strategy, according to the project proposal document, involved a combination of CLTS (Community Led Total Sanitation), PHAST (Participatory Hygiene And Sanitation Transformation), and CHAST (Child Hygiene And Sanitation Training). CHAST was undertaken in two schools (Rekeke and Longo) to assist children adopt behaviour of personal hygiene and environmental sanitation both in school and at home. It was accompanied by a hardware component involving the construction of water harvesting facilities at two schools that have no access to water (one in each county). The two schools, Mreroni (Mombasa) and Mwakajo (T.Taveta) were added to the project after the implementation gap to separately benefit from rainwater harvesting at the request of both county governments. The CLTS on the other hand, entailed mobilizing communities to completely eliminate open defecation.

Based on the consultations with stakeholders in the target schools, the evaluation concluded that the project successfully met its objective under this component. This assessment is confirmed by and consistent with the findings of the school impact assessment² which concluded that "project interventions have had positive impact on the health and well-being, enrollment, retention, completion and performance rate; attitude and practice change among the learners, as well as significant gains for the girl child', with the awareness levels of the WASH activities in the two schools rated at 100%. Furthermore, there was evidence of surrounding communities also having added value to the school programme by contributing towards WASH infrastructure, like new toilet blocks and hand washing facilities.

At the house hold level, target communities were proactively engaged in the construction of pit latrines and other domestic and environmental sanitation activities. The project was also credited with the eradicated open defecation in target communities.

A setback under this component was with respect to the rainwater harvesting facilities for Mreroni and Mwakajo primary schools, which had not been completed by the time of the evaluation, challenge attributed to the implementation gap period. It was however confirmed that the relevant surveys had been conducted and materials mobilized at the respective sites. MNU has committed to finalizing and handing over the two facilities, filled up with water and ready for use, by mid-March 2018.

i. Longo Primary school (Mombasa)

Based on feedback from the school administration, the school WASH programme, which involved training and limited support for water facilities, has been a success, its achievements reflected on the overall improved enrollment and retention rate of pupils including girls. One of the notable features

² Impact Assessment on WASH in Schools in Taita Taveta & Mombasa Counties, R.W. Ruth W. Muthoni January,2018

of the WASH activities is the existence of a vibrant health club, whose members engage other pupils in continuous WASH training to all classes.

Prior to the project, the school had no running water, and frequent disruptions was a major challenge as children frequently returned home between lessons to drink water or to use toilets. Absenteeism was caused by hygiene related illnesses and among girls, lack of menstrual sanitation. These factors overall resulted in generally low school performance. By the time of the evaluation in February 2018, the school had reportedly enrolled a total 607 pupil from 500 in December 2017. Hygiene related illnesses such as diarrhea and ringworms among children had been eradicated to zero levels. The rate of absenteeism among children especially girls has also reported to have significantly improved. School performance also improved, with the highest grade ever to be achieved by a pupil in the school of 420 out of 500.

*“Children confirmed to have acquired knowledge on personal hygiene, knowledge on diseases prevention through good personal hygiene practices like drinking boiled or treated water, keeping oneself clean and brushing of teeth; and knowledge on simple water treatment practices and proper waste disposal. On the same indicators, 100% of the interviewed parents confirmed that menstrual management trainings have had a big impact on the girls’ wellbeing and attendance to school. Over 90% confirmed there is improved attendance at school with a similar number saying open defecation is no longer a practice at the school and at the community. Regular hand washing, trainings in personal and environmental hygiene and improved hygiene also scored very highly (>95%) in terms of contribution and benefits. Enrolment at Longo primary has significantly improved following the construction of modern toilet blocks (29 toilets: 15 for girls & 14 for boys) that are well served with water taps and hand washing basins. It also has ample water storage tanks and the school environment is very clean. This together with high performance has kept the enrolment in all classes on a record high.” **Impact Assessment of Longo Primary School.***

Significant changes in WASH practices were also reported among parents and members of local community. The local community also now has access to the school water, which has further boosted its access to clean water. A rapid knowledge tests to community group interviewed reflected confidence in their ability to engage in safe WASH practices.

Table 2: Summary of results in Longo Primary School

Baseline	Output	Immediate Results Impact
----------	--------	--------------------------

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No water point in the school • Limited awareness about the right method of handwashing, treatment and storage of drinking water. • Frequent hygiene related illnesses. • High levels of absenteeism • Poor disposal of garbage and stool • Poor toilet practices including OD 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Water access project completed and hand washing points in use • Health club established and functioning. • WASH education to the whole school mainstreamed through health club. • Children and parents trained and engaged with the WASH education in the school and extended to their neighborhoods. • Toilets have hand washing points • 2 garbage pits dug and under use in school • Surrounding community trained in boiling or treatment of drinking water, safe garbage and child stool, disposal, proper toilet use, cleaning compounds. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enrollment increased from 500 in Dec 2017 to 607 by Feb 2018. • Increased school attendance with minimal absenteeism. • Eradication of ringworms and other hygiene related diseases. • Performance improvement highest ever grades recorded of 420 • Behavior change among children and surrounding community.
--	---	--

ii. Rekeke School – Taita Taveta County

The school is among those whose water supply was disconnected by TAVEVO due to accumulated unpaid bills. The school currently uses a donated alternative water storage tank, which is regularly filled by water purchased from supply tankers. Through the WASH awareness training, the school administration has purchased two hand washing urns (one for boys and one for girls) with contribution from parents, who have been sensitized on the importance of clean drinking water hand washing for their children’s health. The 20-liter urns, though small, have boosted hygiene for children who bring their lunch food and fruits from home, and provides easy access to drinking water. Children’s WASH awareness is maintained through the activities of the school health clubs

Prior to the project, the school fraternity and surrounding community had limited WASH awareness training. “Even teachers did not know how to properly wash hands, a teacher said. In addition to the water urns, the parents also contributed towards construction of a toilet facility for the school.

Because much of the surrounding area has rural households with no access to piped water, the community is now directly engaging county authorities and TAVEVO for better access to water. They have lobbied for interim water storage tanks to be supplied with water tankers as they devise strategies for a long-term solution. Part of the community including pastoralist have also successfully been facilitated in conservation of the endangered Njoro Ndogo natural water springs, which was their only source of water. The community has as a result mobilized to protect the spring, and planting trees as well separating areas for animal grazing and for accessing domestic water.

In terms of impact, Rekeke school enrollment had increased from 520 in December 2017, to 560 February 2018. According to the school administration, “not a day goes by without a new pupil being enrolled”. With improved access to water and WASH practices, hygiene related illnesses have reduced as compared with the past where a number of cases of diarrhea would be referred daily to the dispensary. There was also a marked improvement in academic performance in the school. In 2017, the school recorded its best ever Standard 8 performance of 330 marks (Girl). In order to motivate other children and continue the trend, the school administration, in collaboration with parents and local authorities, went further to sponsor the top pupil to a provincial Secondary School

Benefits of the WASH awareness training also have cascaded further to the surrounding community, through local advocacy by schoolchildren and their parents. It has become a standard practice for parents use the opportunity of community meetings to talk about WASH.

“At Rekeke, the project has had significant gains on the various indexes. For example, on the enrolment indicator, in 2018, the school enrolled 21 more children than in 2017 bringing the school pupil population to 544 up from 523 pupils in 2017. This was a 3.8% growth. Increased girl’s enrolment was attributed to the WASH interventions as confirmed by the schools. Teachers confirmed that girls used to be very embarrassed when they soiled their dresses in school but after the training in menstrual management, this problem has since been addressed... Retention at Rekeke has significantly improved. The teachers interviewed confirmed that since the project begun, the dropout rate is insignificant. In 2017 for example, only 2-3 children dropped out of school while 2018 has so far recoded no drop out. The school confirmed that children are now healthier and able to attend school without distractions. Parents confirmed that so far, completion rate is good including for the over aged learners (16-20 years). They estimated the completion to have increased from 60% to 95% in the last three years.” **Impact Assessment of Rekeke Primary School.**

According to the community members interviewed, majority of household around the school have changed their toilet practices from open defecation, to building and using latrines at every household. As women take responsibility for handling domestic water and domestic hygiene, men utilize their training to maintain clean compounds, through safe garbage disposal and grass cutting.

The WASH training has also opened community to the value of improving their relationship with their local leaders as well as collaborating with teachers on WASH issues. The community in Njoro Ndogo, recently faced with new challenges of sourcing water due to flooding and siltation have successfully lobbied local leaders to assist in building a dyke to protect the spring from flooding and siltation. Rekeke school, however still faces a number of school WASH infrastructure challenges, that the school administration and parents are looking to resolve with their acquired advocacy skills.

Table 3: Summary of results in Rekeke Primary School:

Baseline	Output	Immediate Results Impact
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Handwashing points • Very limited no. of toilets • School water supply disconnected • Limited awareness about handwashing, treatment and storage of drinking water. • Frequent hygiene related illnesses. • High levels of absenteeism • Poor disposal of garbage and stool 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 Hand washing urns purchased by parents • New additional toilets block constructed by parents in school and in every household. • Health club established and functioning. • WASH education to the whole school mainstreamed through health club. • Children and parents trained and engaged with the WASH education in the school and extended to their neighborhoods. • Garbage pits dug and uses in school and households • Community trained in safe WASH practices 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enrollment increased from 520 in Dec 2017 to 560 by Feb 2018. • Increased school attendance with minimal absenteeism due to minimized hygiene related illnesses. • Performance improvement highest ever grades recorded of 330 • Early pregnancies dropped from 5 or 6 a year to zero in 2017.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor toilet practices including OD. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attitude and Behavior change.
---	--	---

iii. **Mwakajo Primary School, Voi Sub-County, Taita Taveta**

Mwakajo primary school, located on the remote arid hills of Voi sub-county is one of the 22 schools in the area affected by extreme water scarcity, and therefore also a target beneficiary of one of the project’s rain water harvesting facilities in addition to WASH training. The delivery of this hardware component had, however, not been completed being among the activities affected by the 9-month project implementation gap. The facility is nevertheless being eagerly anticipated to reverse most of the current water related challenges affecting the school, including inability to consistently cook lunch for the children due to lack of water. A beneficiary of the government’s school feeding programme, the school mostly relies on water carried by pupils for cooking but who often have none in their homes. Attendance currently fluctuates based on availability of food as well as due to frequent reported illnesses. With the school’s priority focused on how to sustain food support for the children, WASH education and deworming activities are expected to properly take off once the water harvesting facility has been completed.

The benefits of the rain water facility are expected to begin flowing immediately after being handed over already filled to its 30,000l capacity, boosting access drinking water, cleanliness, sanitation, improved school feeding. With its new sanitation block with taps for girls, the water facility will also greatly enhance girls’ hygiene in addition to boosting overall the school welfare.

iv. **Mreroni Primary School, Mombasa**

Mreroni Primary School is located on the remote outer edge of Mombasa bordering Kilifi County. Disadvantaged by its geographical isolation, the school and surrounding community is yet to be reached by most government services like piped water, road infrastructure, and health facilities. Due to limited water access, the school was also selected to benefit from the project’s rain water harvesting facility.

Although not completed by the time of the evaluation, the water harvesting facility is expected to provide much relief to the school and surrounding community, which currently gets water from an unsafe source shared with animals.

With no running water flowing at school, children carry their own drinking water from home. Sanitation is generally poor for both the school and surrounding community, being one of the areas hard hit by a cholera outbreak in 2017. A survey conducted by the ministry of health in 2017³ found that up to 92 percent of children in the school were infected with typhoid. The school refers between 3 and 4 children who fall ill daily to the dispensary, at the cost of approx. USD 12 per child. High rates of absenteeism and poor performance was directly linked to poor health due lack of safe water in the school. The highest performance in the final year exam was 360, though majority of pupils scored far below this average score.

³ According to the school administration

With minimal government capitation grants to schools for water (Approx. USD 100 monthly), the school will sustain the water flow in the long dry season months by selling water to the community, to generate sufficient funds for purchasing trucked water from vendors (at approx. USD90 per 10,000l tank).

A major setback for social accountability, however, is the inability of pupils to use the new county government sponsored sanitation block, because its flush toilets have proved inappropriate without running water. A county planned drilling of a borehole in the school compound also failed after relevant county officials insisted that it had been reported completed.

2.1.3. Improved understanding of Duty Bearers in their role and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services

This component involved capacity building trainings in relevant WASH issues for duty bearers. The project aimed to balance the capacity building of civil society structures with capacity building of county structures and local duty bearers, with a focus on the devolution of rights and responsibilities from the national government to the county structures. This was expected to foster an environment where both rights holders and duty bearers equally have an increased understanding of their respective roles as well as challenges and local priorities in the WASH sector. A key area of emphasis was in creating shared spaces for dialogue between duty bearers and rights holders, that had not come into existence.

The evaluation rated this component of the project as successfully implemented and results fairly satisfactory in both counties though impact was most prominent in Taita Taveta County where duty bearers have robustly engaged citizens in county activities. With the creation of the water management committees, duty bearers felt presented with an avenue to constructively engage citizens and mutually find solutions to WASH challenges. The transitional challenges of elections notwithstanding, the two counties adopted the various project processes like participatory planning, WASH policy development and social accountability measures with service providers.

Duty bearers consulted in Taita Taveta, notably TAVEVO were engaging with citizens in regular meetings to solve problems and improve service delivery. Similar activities were reported in Mombasa between MOWASCO and MCWAG to improve service delivery and social accountability. Mombasa, which shares important long-term cooperation with Maji Na Ufanisi in WASH also is extending water access to more informal settlements and rural areas in consultation and collaboration with citizen representatives.

TAVEVO on the other hand, felt that the initiative has alleviated some of the key challenges it was facing in delivering on its work, by helping to resolve issues with inflated bills, reducing vandalism of water facilities, and expanding water access to more households. The company is currently in talks with county authorities to resume water supply to many schools that have been disconnected for long periods due to unpaid water bills. Once the critical issues of access to water have been looked into, TAVEVO and county authorities will engage in construction of the first sewage plant and public sanitation blocks for the rapidly growing Voi town, another key citizen priority captured in the county development plan.

There were, however, pockets of resistance experienced especially in Mombasa where it was felt citizen participation in planning and decision making might take much longer to fully be embraced. According to the project team, Mombasa County required more lobbying to meaningfully engage citizens as compared with Taita Taveta County, which has fully adopted it, albeit with challenges of accessing its county assembly. This challenge might also be explained by the fact that capacity building for duty bearers was only conducted in Taita Taveta and not in Mombasa due to delays associated with the implementation gap period.

2.2. Relevance

The “*Advocacy on Good Governance on WASH Project in Mombasa and Taita Taveta Counties*” was highly relevant, as it was consistent with the goal of Maji Na Ufanisi and DPA to strengthen civil society in WASH advocacy in Kenya as well as the national WASH legislation and policy. The relatively poor coverage of WASH facilities and awareness in the target areas further emphasized the project relevance. The project focus on governance in the context of devolution in Kenya was highly relevant in the light of the transitional challenges faced with integrating citizen participation into county planning and policy making processes. In terms of strategy, the emphasis on capacity building in both county planning and WASH programming was relevant for long-term impact. The structure of MCWAG and Okoa Maji membership in terms of gender, age and disability, was not only in conformity with national policies of integration, but also furthered relevance for inclusive community level advocacy. A point of weakness in terms of relevance was the activity-based log frame as opposed to a results based framework, which details out intended outcomes or results expected from project interventions - I.e. this would enhance clarity on the cause-and-effect relationships with respect to theory of change.

2.3. Effectiveness

The project results highly demonstrated effectiveness in the following ways:

- **Surpassed targets** - Through its long-term strategy of combining WASH programming with governance, the project reached and, in some cases, surpassed its targets, leaving behind effective community and county structures. For example, while the project targeted specific communities and schools for its direct intervention, the changes achieved in county governance as well as WASH advocacy through mass media have produced benefits going well beyond those target groups.
- **Growing of community of WASH practitioners** - The knowledge acquired from capacity building of 2,255⁴ rights holders and duty bearers has created a community of WASH practitioners who have and will act as public watchdogs for inclusive governance and social accountability in the two counties.
- **Schools and centers for community learning** - The use of schools as centers for community led WASH awareness training also proved effective. Although the evaluation could not

⁴ See Annex 3 for a breakdown of project participants

ascertain the full number of community members who have directly benefitted from the project, consultations with beneficiaries revealed that capacity building conducted will effectively translate into long term behavior change in personal hygiene and environmental sanitation beyond the target schools and surrounding communities. The reported changing habits such as the eradication of open defecation, and construction of toilets in each household in the Taveta community around Rekeke school is a case in point.

- **Compounded benefits** - In terms of benefit to learners, over 1200 children in Rekeke and Longo primary schools are benefitting from the projects WASH programme, having registered improved access to water, sanitation, health, enrollment, retention, and performance. A similar number of children is expected to begin enjoying similar benefits once the rainwater harvesting facilities are completed and in use.
- **Flexibility** - Flexibility was a key element in the effectiveness of the programme. Faced with internal management challenges that included a 9-month implementation gap as well external risk of election related political turmoil, the project partners demonstrated flexibility, by allowing some project elements to continue running while revising and adjusting other components without losing sight of the objectives.
- **Limitations**- Retention of county technical staff is highly essential for the effectiveness of any capacity building project. The project having been implemented in between 2013 and 2017 was subject to disruption from political reshuffles and bureaucratic transfers. The loss of trained duty bearers in Taita Taveta therefore limited effectiveness. In Mombasa, failure to train duty bearers, also affected the outcome of participatory planning.

2.4. Efficiency

Based on the immediate and anticipated long term transforming effect on county governance, service delivery, and community WASH practice, the project was found to be highly efficient. By design, the project's long-term approach guarantees sustainability, which in itself ensures value for money. Efficiency was further demonstrated in the following ways:

- **Value addition** - Although citizen participation in the project design was only anticipated for WASH governance, the project utilized the platform to also provide Kenya with a practical template for inclusive planning and decision making that can be tailored and applied across all sectors. The project's use of the WASH platform to also support citizen discussions around conservation and other inputs beyond WASH to their respective county plans supports this claim.
- **Leveraging resources** - The project leveraged resources and time to enhance project benefits. For example, within the same funding basket allocated for citizen participation, MNU included the training of community level focal points for mobilizing citizen to participate in key meetings and events in each county. In the same vein, the project also used the opportunity of calendar events such as World Water Day to show case WASH priorities, lobby duty bearers, and drive WASH policy issues.
- **Building on existing networks** - The use of existing citizen networks as the platforms to source for water action committee members as citizen representatives enhanced project efficiency by capitalizing on the relationships and trust already established at the

grassroots, which in turn saved effort and time for project entry and access to the community.

- **Limitation** - Efficiency was, however, dented by the delayed completion of the hardware component on the school WASH programme, a challenge attributed to the implementation gap period. While determining the actual impact of the two water facilities falls beyond the scope of this evaluation, beneficiaries who have highlighted the current difficulties faced by Mreroni and Mwakajo primary schools which lack water, have forcefully expressed the anticipated benefits, which can be revisited at a later date. The evaluation confirmed that the relevant surveys had been conducted and materials mobilized at the sites. MNU committed to finalizing and handing over the two facilities by mid-March 2018.

2.5. Impact

The project's impact in Mombasa and Taita Taveta Counties was significant in two areas: i) improved governance and services, through the integration of citizen participation in county decision making processes and ii) improved community and school health with compounded benefits such as increased school enrollment, retention and performance. These changes are detailed as follows:

- **Unpacking of devolution** – The project has successfully translated the meaning of citizen participation and demonstrated practical methods of institutionalizing it within county government structures. This mainstreaming of citizen participation has given meaning to Kenya's devolution in the eyes of the public. Although a constitutional requirement, citizen participation conducted by counties to-date has at best, been superficial, perceived as an exercise to satisfy formalities as opposed to meaningful engagement. This achievement carries long term significance, most importantly as a standard for counties to follow when engaging citizens.
- **Improved services** - One of the most significant impacts of the project is the improved water services in both counties, due to increased responsiveness and social accountability among water service providers, MOWASCO and TAVEVO. Challenges like inflated water bills, vandalism of water installments, were being resolved through shared platforms between citizen representatives and company officials. In the case of Taita Taveta, a complaint register linked to its billing mechanism has been established, a step gradually improving public perception and social accountability.
- **School benefits** - The impact of the school WASH programme was assessed through this evaluation and also through the independent impact assessment of selected beneficiary schools in January 2018 to provide evidence of the positive impact of improved service delivery at the school level. As indicated in the general findings section above, both undertakings recorded a significant improvement in school enrollment, attendance and performance in beneficiary schools, as a result of school health clubs. The impact assessment further confirms evaluation findings in Rekeke and Longo schools that "results in which Rekeke produced the best student (girl) in the Sub County with 330 marks while Longo primary produced the best candidate in the County with 420 marks (boy) in 2017, up from 390 and 378 in 2016 and 2015 respectively. These changes are attributed to healthier children who are able to attend school without disruptions by common WASH

related illnesses.” The impact could have been significantly higher in Rekeke if the school had better hand washing facilities and toilets. Similarly, the current indicators for Mreroni and Mwakajo primary schools, are expected to significantly change as soon as the rainwater harvesting projects are completed and access to water is improved.

- **Legitimacy** -The joint platforms established between citizen groups and duty bearers to resolve WASH related issues have added to the legitimacy of the beneficiary counties by improving local trust in both county authorities as well as citizen representatives.
- **Gender** - The project has had a positive impact on women and girls. Through their representation and leadership in the water action committees, women’s concerns related to WASH have been discussed and to a large degree, considered in respective county development plans and by service delivery actors. By improving sanitation, menstrual management and access to water in schools, girls' enrollment, retention and performance has improved, while early pregnancies have dropped. The project also Improved access to water also means reduced workload for girls and women. Under its capacity building targeting behavior change, the project has also involved men to become critical change agents against open defecation, leading construction of household toilets and maintaining environmental sanitation.
- **Behaviour change** - The project impact was especially significant on local communities. All stakeholders felt that a lot of changes in the attitude and behavior of beneficiary communities, like ending of open defecation, local initiatives to build toilets and improved handling of household water, were attributable to the project. Knowledge tests revealed confidence in methods of treatment and storage of drinking water, garbage disposal, safe disposal of infant stool, slashing compound grass and other environmental sanitation activities.
- **Adopting of WASH approach in community health policy** – Project impact also has been felt at the county, where its WASH strategy is perceived as not only complimentary but also a more cost-effective preventive community health strategy that is being considered for adoption as policy. Through its unique approach to capacity building, the project utilized strong messaging techniques such as graphically illustrating how fecal matter returns to community food through unsafe hygiene practices. This approach has majorly contributed to the eradication of open defecation in target communities. Duty bearers in Taita Taveta are strongly advocating the use of this collaborative approach, involving schools, communities and community health volunteers throughout the county.
- **Adoption of water action group in county water department** - As a measure of furthering the project’s achievements, the Taita Taveta County government is planning to integrate a component of citizen action group within its water department. The county also has announced plans to start a regular stakeholders forum in order to further enhance social accountability as well as build synergy with TAVEVO, which is currently under its delegated authority to deliver WASH services.
- **Organizational impact** - At the organizational level, the project has significantly raised the

Maji na Ufanisi profile in the Coast region as a household name with respect to WASH. Through the project, MNU is benefitting from good relationships with local authorities and service providers, as well as strengthened its community networks and collaborative partnerships. For example, the county water department of Taita Taveta at the time of the evaluation, sought to consult MNU over the possibility of partnership in managing public sanitation blocks proposed for Voi town. However, with its increased engagements in the region and impact of the project, MNU is facing additional demands for continued engagement to further solidify and expand the project to other areas.

- ***Conflict resolution and peaceful coexistence*** - One of the unexpected outcomes of the project was the peaceful settling of water conflict between pastoralists and farming groups in the Njoro Ndogo area of Taveta sub-county. Njoro Ndogo, a natural water spring was endangered by harmful local water harvesting practices, resulting in negative competition between farmers and pastoralists. The project facilitated conservation activities and training on better WASH practices which included separating areas for drawing domestic water from animal grazing areas and for farming. During the evaluation, the residents of Njoro Ndogo, both pastoralists and farmers were, unlike before, sharing their views while sitting side by side.

2.6. Sustainability

Sustainability is concerned with measuring whether the benefits of the intervention are likely to continue after donor funding has been withdrawn.

- ***Institutionalized structures*** -A major point for sustainability in this project is that its processes and outputs are being adopted and institutionalized within the beneficiary County governments, as well as within community structures liked MCWAG and Okoa Maji, which have both become registered legal entities with independent mandates of mobilizing own resources to advance WASH issues beyond the life of the project.
- ***Template for Devolution*** - The project's foundational work in "unpacking" devolution, especially creating the operational structures for citizen participation will remain a valuable practical template for implementing citizen participation beyond the two beneficiary counties.
- ***Mainstreaming WASH approach in community health strategy*** - Based on the demonstrated impact of the project's school and community WASH awareness training, duty bearers of Taita Taveta County have expressed desire to modify its existing community health strategy to include the project's collaborative WASH approach. This preventive county community health policy will mainstream the project' approach and sustain outcomes throughout the county.
- ***Income generating model*** - The rain water harvesting projects in Merero and Mwakajo primary schools will be sustained at two levels. First, the project has trained local artisans in the operations and maintenance (O&M) of the facilities. Second, both schools will generate income from selling water to the surrounding communities, in order to purchase trucked water in the long drought periods. Such a business model will guarantee access

to clean water for the schools throughout the year and also extend project benefits beyond the school to surrounding communities.

3. CHALLENGES

- **Political risks** - The project was implemented in between two general elections of 2013 and 2017 and was therefore subject to the associated political instability and change of office bearers. Although this political risk had been anticipated in the project planning stage, the disputed presidential election results prolonged the instability in the operating environment, significantly impacting on some project outcomes. By its design, the project must work with political actors and processes, and therefore future programming will need to strong mitigation measures against impact of elections.
- **Staff changes** - Linked to political risk were the institutional setbacks caused by county technical personnel reshuffles after elections. Such staff changes after every elections not only undermine the stability of county governments, but also their capacity to deliver service to the population as reflected by its disruptive effect on project's capacity building efforts.
- **Implementation-gap** - The nine-month gap in project implementation occasioned delays that have adversely affected the efficiency of the project with respect to schedules of delivery for some of its components. The component most affected pertains to the rainwater harvesting facilities planned for two beneficiary schools, which had by end of project, not been completed. A major factor was the midway adjustment (at the request of both county governments) introducing new beneficiary schools for the rainwater harvesting, separate from the two initial targets of WASH health promotion. Also affected by the gap period was the capacity building for duty bearers. Furthermore, a significant amount of resources were used to regain commitment and secure buy-in from the participating communities and duty bearers.
- **Corruption** - Corruption and Political interests were reported to be the main threat to the integration of citizen participation in both Mombasa and Taita Taveta counties. Stakeholders contended that even though devolution was improving delivery of services and social accountability, there were still pockets of resistance that were undermining genuine engagement. The concerns were more directed at Mombasa county although in Taita Taveta, access to county assembly members was an issue.
- **Information sharing** - Citizen participation in county planning and policy making is a constitutional requirement, however, its quality and effectiveness to a large extent, relies on the goodwill of county authorities to provide essential information pertaining to dates, venue and timing of such activities. In Mombasa, the limited flow of information from county offices was reported as a major factor undermining the extent to which MCWAG could engage in county activities. The approach to information sharing is often confusing, delivered on short notice and shared through inappropriate media such as Whatsup as opposed the more accessible mass media. This often results in poorly attended meetings and some decisions made by small elite groups. Even where information is accessible, it is often full of jargon and budgets obscure thus preventing meaningful citizen engagement.

Lack of WASH budget – With no dedicated budget for WASH in the counties, (it falls in between the two ministries – “Water and Natural Resources” and of “Public Health and Sanitation”), there are limited resources that can be allocated to WASH without intervention through political goodwill. Apart from improving budget literacy and continued lobbying for the implementation of WASH policies that can guarantee direct allocation within county budget lines, this challenge also points to the need for transparency in the budgeting process and subsequent monitoring and tracking. Concerted efforts on lobbying for increase of funds for the sector coupled with intensive budget literacy may improve WASH services.

- **Local ownership of schools** - Motivating parents in poor communities to contribute towards operations and maintenance (O&M) of school infrastructure was an issue for most schools. This was exacerbated by frequent vandalism of school facilities due to lack of security walls. However, during the evaluation, sensitized community members consulted expressed enthusiasm for taking more ownership of school facilities including facility maintenance, supporting payment of water bills and, even in the case of Longo Primary School, recruitment of sanitation workers.

4. LESSONS LEARNED/ALTERNATIVES

- **Deepening citizen participation** - The project has demonstrated that duty bearers can be responsive to positive engagement of citizens, especially on the part of water service providers. More efforts however must be made to strengthen the commitment of county authorities in translating policy into action, in particular the involvement of duty bearers who develop budgets and allocate funds for development. Deepening citizen participation is going to be a critical element in influencing the resistant pockets still existing in the County governments. As realized by stakeholders on both sides, the power of citizen engagement in combating corruption and impunity within county administrations cannot be over emphasized and therefore should be the focus of future intervention, in particular a strong component of civic education that trickles down to below the sub-county levels.
- **Learning, Sharing and replication:** Though this project, MNU is strategically positioned as an authority in Kenya’s devolution process. The valuable experiences from this important foundational work should be packaged and be disseminated to benefit other counties as a model of WASH governance that works. Maji Na Ufanisi should therefore consider mobilizing financial resources that will facilitate dissemination to other county platforms. The information and learning component can include technical assistance as part of expanding and diversifying its funding opportunities. The learning components could also include inter county and bench-marking tours for duty bearers to share experiences and learn from each other. For example, the more resistant elements in Mombasa County could be motivated by how embracing citizen participation has allowed Taita Taveta County to address difficult WASH problems and develop a rich strategic plan.
- **Schools as centers of WASH knowledge** - This project has demonstrated that schools can effectively become catalysts of community behaviour change. The concept of health clubs was a good model for child peer education as well as community influencer.
- **Different incentives for different parties** - The project was planned with the assumption that its activities would achieve the same results in both target counties. While this assumption

remains true on some project components, results varied between Mombasa and Taita Taveta on citizen participation. In order to mitigate against such an outcome in the future, it might require looking into ways of incentivizing or ascertaining the commitment of duty bearers prior to implementation, with more attention being paid to clarifying responsibilities of parties involved. Such measures can include signing of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) as a public commitment binding each party to their agreed responsibilities.

- **Baseline and Impact Surveys** – One of the strengths of this project was the decision to conduct baseline survey and impact assessment. Both are best practices that are useful in benchmarking the impact of the project.
- **Citizen priorities much be guided by long term technical consideration** - As observed by the Taita Taveta County Chief Officer for Water, public participation, if not “used properly” can pose serious challenges to development, especially when citizen agenda is hijacked by short-term political interests rather than well-guided long term technical considerations. Citizen priorities will need continuous assessment of long term “value for money” guided by technical considerations, as opposed to politically influenced projects with short-term “value for votes” agenda.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations in this report are proposed with respect to the sustainability of the project, and future programming based on the findings of the evaluation as follows:

- **Support to water action groups** - MCWAG and Okoa Maji are registered CBOs still in their formative stages. There is need for them to be strengthened to allow them to sustain their social accountability watchdog role and representation of citizen interests in county processes. They will therefore require both financial and technical support to properly formulate their institutional arrangements, in particular, work plans and strategies for resource mobilization.
- **Integration of natural water resource conservation** – The reported deterioration of major water sources in the target region is strongly linked to lack of access to clean water as a basic tenet of WASH programing. Future interventions must incorporate natural water resource conservation as and related impacts of climate change as essential elements in rights-based WASH programming pivotal for achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 6 and also others related to good health and gender equality.
- **Media role** – Adequate resources for media for highlighting and reporting on water issues is essential to sustained public engagement and for entrenching behaviour, cultural and institutional changes that will continue to generate benefits beyond the target areas.
- **Retention of county chief technical officers** – Effective capacity building in WASH governance requires institutional continuity, hence the need for mitigating against disruption. Addressing the high county staff turn-over linked to the electoral cycle will enhance institutional effectiveness in service delivery and social accountability. Future programming should

incorporate effective lobbying for the retention and maintenance of county chief technical officers.

- ***Integration of community water needs in school water projects*** -A key observation during the evaluation is the close inter-dependency between beneficiary schools and their surrounding communities with respect to water needs. The decisions by Mreroni and Mwakajo Primary Schools to sell water illustrates this relationship. This calls for future water projects to include considerations for community needs in their plans. For example, a school with a borehole or rain water harvesting facility in a water stressed environment needs security from vandalism and also often needs community contribution for sanitation blocks and other WASH facilities. The community on the other hand can benefit from the school water, but there needs to be terms for sustainable access and use. Project planning must take these considerations into account.
- ***Devolving water action committees*** - The achievements of Okoa Maji and MCWAG have confirmed water action committees as an effective advocacy model with a dual purpose of engaging both counties and communities. Devolving this structure to the sub - county and village levels will further enhance citizen capacity for advocacy, monitoring, reporting and social accountability in county development programmes.
- ***Continuous capacity building*** – Given the long-term significance of this project, Maji Na Ufanisi should mobilize additional resources for continued capacity building especially strengthening citizens ability for advocacy, monitoring, reporting and social accountability, and ensure continued dissemination at the grassroots. Capacity building should cover not only WASH, but also confronting critical areas such as effects of climate change and building local ownership of conservation of natural water resources and forested areas.
- ***Tailored approaches for different contexts*** – County WASH governance programming should tailor and adapt its strategies to each context, rather than use one-approach for every county. The project’s varied result between Mombasa and Taita Taveta was partly attributed to this one-approach application.

6. ANNEXES

Annex 1: Project Log Frame

Annex 2: Activities Carried Out

Annex 3: Direct Beneficiaries by Gender

Annex 4: Evaluation TORs

Annex 5: Selected Project Related Media Coverage

Annex 6: Photos